

1 Damian Fernandez (206662)
2 **LAW OFFICE OF DAMIAN R. FERNANDEZ**
3 14510 Big Basin Way, Suite A, PMB 285
4 Saratoga, California 95070-6091
5 Telephone: (408) 354-8684
6 Facsimile: (408) 904-7391

7 Eric H. Gibbs (CA Bar No. 178658)
8 Elizabeth C. Pritzker (CA Bar No. 146267)
9 Aaron M. Sheanin (CA Bar No. 214472)
10 Geoffrey A. Munroe (CA Bar No. 228590)

11 **GIRARD GIBBS LLP**
12 601 California Street, 14th Floor
13 San Francisco, California 94108
14 Telephone: (415) 981-4800
15 Facsimile: (415) 981-4846

16 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs and the Proposed Class*

17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

**IN RE APPLE & AT&TM ANTITRUST
LITIGATION**

Case No. 07-cv-05152 JW

**DECLARATION OF ERIC H. GIBBS IN
SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR
APPOINTMENT OF INTERIM CO-LEAD
CLASS COUNSEL**

Date: March 10, 2008
Time: 10:00 a.m.
Place: Courtroom 8

Honorable James Ware

1 I, Eric H. Gibbs, hereby declare as follows:

2 1. I am a member in good standing of the State Bar of California and admitted to practice
3 before this Court. I have personal knowledge of the facts stated herein and, if called on to do so, could
4 and would testify competently thereto. I am a partner of Girard Gibbs LLP and make this declaration
5 in support of the motion of the *Smith* plaintiffs for appointment as interim lead counsel.

6 2. This litigation arises from an unlawful arrangement between defendants Apple, Inc.
7 (“Apple”) and AT&T Mobility LLC (“AT&T”) to tie iPhones to AT&T cellular telephone service and
8 deny iPhone users the right to use third party applications on their iPhones. Apple released the iPhone
9 on June 29, 2007. On September 27, 2007, Apple released a software update, known as the iPhone
10 Software Version 1.1 that permanently disabled any iPhone that was unlocked to allow service on a
11 carrier other than AT&T or that had downloaded and installed third party applications. In essence,
12 plaintiffs allege that Apple crippled the iPhones of those who would not submit to Apple’s and
13 AT&T’s unfair and illegal business practices.

14 4. Girard Gibbs has extensive experience in prosecuting class actions involving consumer
15 fraud, telecommunications and antitrust in particular. Girard Gibbs currently serves as liaison counsel
16 on behalf of the direct purchaser plaintiff class in *In re TFT-LCD (Flat Panel) Antitrust Litigation*,
17 MDL No. 1827 (N.D. Cal.), and as co-chair of the Discovery Committee in *In re Natural Gas Anti-*
18 *Trust Cases I, II, III, & IV*, JCCP 4221, 4224, 4226 and 4228 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Diego County),
19 antitrust litigation against numerous natural gas companies for manipulating the California natural gas
20 market, which has achieved settlements of \$153 million to date. Based in San Francisco, the firm has
21 represented clients throughout the United States in complex antitrust, securities, civil rights,
22 telecommunications, product liability, and consumer protection actions since 1995.

23 5. The firm has also represented a variety of individuals and businesses in complex and
24 precedent-setting litigation, including *Fricke Parks Press, Fricke-Parks Press, Inc. v. Fang*, Case No.
25 C-00-3726 (VRW), 149 F. Supp. 2d 1175 (N.D. Cal. 2001) (antitrust litigation); national trucking
26 brokerage Allen Lund Company, *Lund v. AT&T Corp.*, Case No. C 98-1500-DDP (C.D. Cal.)
27 (nationwide slamming scheme); Jefferson Insurance Company and Fireman’s Fund Insurance
28 Company, *Jefferson Insurance Co. v. Rouhana*, Case No. 01-cv-11522, 2006 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 7618

(S.D.N.Y. Feb. 27, 2006) (securities litigation); Preferred Life Insurance Company, *Preferred Life Insurance of New York v. Lucent Technologies, Inc.*, Docket No. MRS-L-1306-02 (New Jersey Super. Ct.) (securities litigation); Nashville country music publisher Cal IV Entertainment, *The Football Association Premier League Limited, et al. v. YouTube, Inc., et al.*, 1:07-cv-03582-LLS (S.D.N.Y.) (digital rights protection); members of San Francisco's Chinese-American community, *Ho v. San Francisco Unified School District*, Case No. C-94-2418-WHO, 2001 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 25904 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 24, 2001) (civil rights); and many other individuals and businesses. Girard Gibbs seeks to apply its experience as plaintiffs' attorneys to manage and resolve civil litigation effectively on behalf of all clients.

6. Cases in which Girard Gibbs has served in a leadership capacity include:

- *In re American Express Financial Advisors Securities Litigation*, Case No. 04-cv-01773-DAB (S.D.N.Y.) (settlement in excess of \$100 million);
- *In re Natural Gas Antitrust Cases I, II, III & IV*, JCCP Nos. 4221, 4224, 4226 and 4228 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Diego County) (settlements of \$153 million);
- *In re i2 Technologies Securities Litigation*, Case No. 3:02-CV-418-H (N.D. Tex.) (\$88 million settlement);
- *In re Prison Realty Securities Litigation*, Case No. 99-cv-0452 (M.D. Tenn.) (\$134 million settlement);
- *In re Digex Litigation*, Consol. Case No. 18336 (Del. Ch. Ct.) (settlement of \$165 million in cash and stock, and non-cash benefits valued at \$450 million);
- *MCI Non-Subscriber Rates Litigation*, MDL No. 1275 (S.D. Ill.) (\$90 million settlement);
- *CalSTRS v. Qwest Communications et al.*, Case No. 415566 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Francisco County) (\$46.5 million settlement for California State Teachers Retirement System);
- *In re Providian Credit Card Cases*, JCCP No. 4085 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Francisco County) (\$105 million settlement);
- *Mitchell v. American Fair Credit Association*, Case No. 785811-2 (Cal. Super. Ct.

Alameda County); *Mitchell v. Bankfirst, N.A.*, Case No. C-97-1421-MMC (N.D. Cal.) (settlement value exceeding \$40 million);

- *In re iPod Cases*, JCCP No. 4355 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Mateo County) (\$15 million settlement);
- *In re UDC Homes Litigation*, Case No. CV 95-08941., (Arizona Sup. Ct. Maricopa County) (\$19.5 million in partial settlements, split defense verdict following 5 month jury trial against Arthur Andersen);
- *In Re PayPal Litigation*, Case No. C-02-1227-JF (PVT) (N.D.Cal) (settlement value exceeding \$14 million);
- *In re Literary Works In Electronic Databases Copyright Litigation*, MDL No. 1379 (GBD) (S.D.N.Y.) (\$18 million settlement);
- *In re Towers Financial Corporation Noteholders Litigation*, MDL No. 994 (S.D.N.Y.) (\$6 million in partial settlements; \$250 million judgment);
- *In re Oxford Tax Exempt Fund Securities Litigation*, Case No. WMN-95-3643 (D. Md.) (settlement exceeding \$10 million);
- *Calliott v. HFS, Inc.*, Case No. 3:97-CV-0924-L (N.D. Tex.) (\$7.3 million settlement, substantially all available insurance following insolvency);
- *In re Total Renal Care Securities Litigation*, Case No. 99-01750 (C.D. Cal.) (liaison counsel) (\$25 million settlement);
- *Lehman v. Blue Shield of California*, Case No. CGC-03-419349 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Francisco County) (\$6.5 million settlement);
- *Powers Law Offices, P.C. v. Cable & Wireless USA, Inc.*, Case No. 99 CV 12007 (EFH) (D. Mass 1999) (\$8 million settlement);
- *In re LookSmart Litigation*, Case No. 02-407778 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Francisco County) (settlement value exceeding \$20 million);
- *Stoddard v. Advanta Corp.*, Case No. 97C-08-206-VAB (Del. Superior Ct.) (settlement for \$7.5 million);

7. The attorneys who will litigate the case include, in addition to the undersigned,

1 Elizabeth C. Pritzker, Aaron M. Sheanin and Geoffrey A. Munroe. The qualifications of these
2 attorneys are described in the firm resume of Girard Gibbs, a true and correct copy of which is attached
3 hereto as Exhibit A.

4 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the
5 foregoing facts are true and correct. Executed this 8th day of February, 2008, at San Francisco,
6 California.

7
8 /s/ Eric H. Gibbs

9 Eric H. Gibbs
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT “A”

GIRARD GIBBS LLP

Attorneys at Law

601 California Street, 14th Floor | San Francisco, CA 94108-2819
Tel: 415.981.4800 | Fax: 415.981.4846 | www.girardgibbs.com

FIRM RESUME

Girard Gibbs LLP specializes in class action and complex business litigation. Founded in 1995, the firm represents clients throughout the United States in securities, antitrust, product liability, and consumer protection actions. The firm specializes in representing and counseling institutional investors in securities and derivative litigation and has advised some of the largest institutional investors in the United States. Girard Gibbs is currently prosecuting securities actions on behalf of Allianz of America, Inc., Fireman's Fund Insurance Company, Jefferson Life Insurance Company, Preferred Life Insurance Company, AGF Asset Management, Cornhill Life Insurance Company and Merchant Investors Insurance Company Ltd. The firm has represented the Kansas Public Employees Retirement System (KPERS) in several securities actions and currently serves as outside counsel to KPERS with respect to all securities litigation. Girard Gibbs has also served as outside counsel to the California Public Employees Retirement System (CalPERS), the California State Teachers' Retirement System (CalSTRS), the State of Wisconsin Investment Board, the Louisiana Teachers' Retirement System, the Louisiana State Employees Retirement System, and the Los Angeles County Employees Retirement Association.

The firm's partners are experienced in all aspects of class action practice and complex securities and business litigation. Girard Gibbs seeks to apply its experience as plaintiffs' attorneys to manage and resolve civil litigation effectively and efficiently on behalf of all the firm's clients. The firm also provides consulting and preventive counseling services to corporate clients and professionals on a variety of legal issues.

PARTNERS

Daniel C. Girard serves as the firm's managing partner and coordinates the prosecution of various securities, antitrust and consumer legal matters handled by the firm.

He has successfully prosecuted over 75 class action matters and served in leadership positions in a number of high-profile cases. Some of the cases in which Mr. Girard served as lead counsel include In re American Express Financial Advisors Securities Litigation, (\$100 million settlement), In re Prison Realty Securities Litigation, (\$104 million settlement), In re i2 Technologies Securities Litigation, (\$88 million settlement), and In re MCI Non-Subscriber Rates Litigation, (\$90 million). Mr. Girard represented the California State Teachers Retirement System in litigation in a non-class securities action against Qwest Communications, Inc. and outside auditor Arthur Andersen, resulting in a recovery of \$45 million for CalSTRS. He also served as a member of the Executive Committee in the Natural Gas Antitrust Cases I, II, III and IV, antitrust litigation against numerous natural gas companies for manipulating the market for natural gas in California. The Natural Gas litigation resulted in total settlements of nearly \$160 million to date.

Mr. Girard currently represents Nashville country music publisher Cal IV Entertainment LLC in copyright litigation against YouTube and Google, Inc. He also represents Allianz of America, Inc., Fireman's Fund and other large private institutional investors in litigation arising out of their investments in Winstar Communications, Inc., and serves as lead counsel in the H&R Block Express IRA Litigation.

Mr. Girard is a member of United States Judicial Conference Advisory Committee on Civil Rules, and participated in the development of the electronic discovery amendments to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. He is a member of the American Law Institute. He is past Chair of the American Bar Association Business Law Section Subcommittee on Class Actions, Co-Chair of the Business and Corporate Litigation Committee's Task Force on Litigation Reform and Rule Revision, and Vice-Chair of the Business and Corporate Litigation Committee. He has served as a guest lecturer on class actions and complex litigation at the major Bay Area law schools.

In 2007, Mr. Girard was honored as a *Northern California Super Lawyer* by Law & Politics Magazine, where he was recognized in the top 5-percent of attorneys practicing in Northern California. He serves as Chair of the Board of Trustees of the St. Matthew's Episcopal Day School in San Mateo, California. He has been a volunteer conservation easement monitor for the Peninsula Open Space Trust since 1991.

He is a 1984 graduate of the School of Law, University of California at Davis, where he served as an editor of the Law Review. He received his undergraduate degree from Cornell University in 1979. Mr. Girard is a member of the California Bar.

Eric H. Gibbs specializes in the prosecution of consumer class actions. Mr. Gibbs has served as court-appointed lead counsel, class counsel and liaison counsel in numerous consumer class actions throughout the United States. He has successfully prosecuted over 40 consumer class action matters, including cases involving defective products, telecommunications, credit cards, unfair competition, false advertising, truth-in-lending, product liability and credit repair under both state and federal consumer protection statutes. Mr. Gibbs has recently acted as court appointed class counsel in the following matters:

- In Re iPod Cases. This action, filed on behalf of approximately two million Apple iPod owners, alleged that Apple made material misrepresentations and omissions in its advertising regarding the lifespan of the iPod's battery. In August 2005, the Honorable Beth Labson Freeman presiding approved a nationwide class settlement that provided warranty extensions, battery replacements, cash payments, and store credits to those class members who experienced a battery failure. In approving the settlement, Judge Freeman said that the class was represented by "extremely well qualified" counsel who negotiated "a significant and substantial benefit to the class members as a result of the settlement of this case."
- Roy v. Hyundai Motor America. In this class action suit brought on behalf of Hyundai Elantra owners, the court approved a nationwide class settlement providing for the repair of allegedly defective passenger-side airbags, reimbursement for transportation related expenses, and an alternative dispute resolution program allowing for trade-ins and buy-backs. In approving the settlement negotiated by Mr. Gibbs as co-lead class counsel, the

Honorable Alicemarie H. Stotler presiding described the settlement as “pragmatic” and a “win-win” for all involved.

- In re General Motors Cases (Sadowski). In this case, plaintiffs allege that GM is responsible for the cost of repairing and replacing the intake manifold gasket in certain GM vehicles. After more than two years of vigorous opposition, the court certified a class, which includes certain 1996-2003 vehicles with 3.1L and 3.4L V6 engines sold in California.
- Kim v. BMW. Plaintiffs in this class action successfully negotiated a recall of certain BMW vehicles, requiring BMW to repair allegedly defective front passenger airbags free of charge.
- Fantauzzo v. Razor. Where plaintiffs alleged that defendant marketed and sold electric scooters with defective stopping mechanisms, the court approved a nationwide class action settlement providing for, among other things, a recall of the potentially defective electric scooters.
- Paul v. HCI Direct. In this case, the plaintiffs alleged that the defendant’s marketing practices were unfair and deceptive, resulting in hundreds of thousands of people paying for merchandise they did not knowingly order. Mr. Gibbs was instrumental in obtaining class certification and in defeating the defendant’s petitions for writ before the California Court of Appeal and the California Supreme Court. In October 2006 the Court approved the settlement, describing it as fair, reasonable, and adequate to the class.
- In Re Girls Gone Wild Litigation. In a case alleging the marketing practices related to defendants’ continuity billing program were unfair and deceptive, the court certified a class of more than 1 million people. The California Court of Appeal denied defendants’ writ petition. A proposed nationwide class settlement is pending.
- Gutzler v. General Motors. In this case, the plaintiffs allege, among other things, that a “Dex-Cool” warranty exists between purchasers of certain of GM’s vehicles and GM, that Dex-Cool is incompatible with the cooling systems in certain of GM’s vehicles, and that Dex-Cool is incompatible with certain of the factory installed intake manifold gaskets in certain of GM’s vehicles. The court certified a class in the matter. The Missouri Court of Appeals and Missouri Supreme Court denied review of the trial court’s certification decision. The matter is scheduled for trial in November 2007.
- Parkinson v. Hyundai Motor America. In a disputed Rule 23(g) motion, the Honorable Alicemarie H. Stotler appointed Mr. Gibbs co-lead interim class counsel. Plaintiffs’ allege, among other things, that Hyundai breached its warranty and engaged in unfair and deceptive practices by selling consumers Hyundai Tiburons with defective flywheels. Plaintiffs’ consolidated amended complaint is due in early September 2006.
- Piercy v. NetZero. In competing motions for appointment of lead counsel in consolidated cases, Judge Victoria Chaney recently appointed Girard Gibbs as lead counsel. Plaintiffs allege, among other things, that NetZero violated consumer protection statutes by wrongfully billing consumers who had cancelled their subscriptions.

Other consumer class actions resulting in favorable settlements for class members in which Mr. Gibbs acted in a leadership role include, Mitchell v. American Fair Credit Association and

Mitchell v. Bankfirst, N.A., which generated one of the largest settlements in the United States under the credit services laws (over \$40 million); Providian Credit Card Cases, which resulted in one of the largest class action recoveries in the United States arising out of consumer credit card litigation (\$105 million); and In re LookSmart Litigation, a nationwide class action settlement providing cash and benefits valued at approximately \$20 million. Companion cases, in which Mr. Gibbs serves as Court appointed co-lead counsel, are pending in California (where the Court recently certified a class), Texas, and Illinois.

Mr. Gibbs is a 1995 graduate of the Seattle University School of Law. He received his undergraduate degree from San Francisco State University in 1991. Before joining Girard Gibbs, he worked for two years as a law clerk for the Consumer Protection Division of the Washington Attorney General's Office. Mr. Gibbs has lectured on consumer class actions, including most recently as a featured speaker for the Litigation Section of the Barristers Club of the San Francisco Bar Association concerning, "Class Certification In Consumer Cases" (2006) and for the Consumer Rights Section of the Barristers Club of the San Francisco Bar Association concerning, "Successfully Obtaining Attorneys' Fees Under Fee-Shifting Statutes" (2004).

Mr. Gibbs is admitted to the California Bar. He also is admitted to practice before the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit, as well as the United States District Courts for the District of Colorado and the Northern, Eastern, Central and Southern Districts of California. Mr. Gibbs is a member of the American Bar Association, the Association of Trial Lawyers of America, the National Association of Consumer Advocates, the Consumer Attorneys of California, the Association of Business Trial Lawyers, the Alameda County Bar Association, and the San Francisco Trial Lawyers Association.

A. J. De Bartolomeo has fifteen years experience in complex litigation, including the prosecution and defense of class actions arising under the securities, communications, consumer protection and copyright laws.

Ms. De Bartolomeo participated in the firm's representation of the California State Teachers Retirement System in CalSTRS v. Qwest Communications, et al., opt-out securities litigation against Qwest Communications, Inc. Ms. De Bartolomeo served as lead counsel in Lehman v. Blue Shield in California Superior Court for the County of San Francisco, where plaintiffs alleged that premium increase practices were unfair and deceptive, and resulted in thousands of people paying additional premiums. The parties negotiated a class-wide settlement, which was approved by the Court. She also assisted in the prosecution and settlement of the American Express Financial Advisors Litigation.

She is a member of the American Bar Association Sections on Litigation, Business Law and Communications and the American Association for Justice. She also is a member of the National Association of Public Pension Attorneys, where she is an active participant in the Task Force on Securities Litigation and Damage Calculation, as well as a member of the Council of Institutional Investors.

Ms. De Bartolomeo is a 1988 graduate of the University of California, Hastings College of the Law. She received her undergraduate degree from Fairfield University in 1982, and a General Course degree in Economics from the University of London, London School of Economics and Political Science (1981). Ms. De Bartolomeo has been invited to speak on

consumer and securities class actions, as well as the settlement approval process before defense law firms, institutional investors and government committees; most recently, for the Fact-finding Mission to Class Actions in the United States, sponsored by the Japan Federation of Bar Associations and Kyoto Bar Association. Before joining Girard Gibbs, Ms. De Bartolomeo was an associate with Robins Kaplan Miller & Ciresi and a Staff Attorney with the Securities and Exchange Commission (Enforcement Division). She is admitted to the California Bar. She also is admitted to practice before the United States Supreme Court, the United States Courts of Appeals for the First and Ninth Circuits, and the United States District Courts for the District of Michigan, the Southern District of Texas, and the Northern, Eastern, Central and Southern Districts of California.

Jonathan K. Levine has nearly 20 years of experience prosecuting complex securities fraud, accounting fraud and class action litigation. He has served and is serving as court-appointed class counsel, lead counsel and liaison counsel in numerous complex class actions in federal courts throughout the United States and in state courts in California. Mr. Levine has prosecuted over 20 securities fraud actions successfully, including cases of complex accounting fraud involving Arthur Andersen, Ernst & Young, KPMG Peat Marwick, Deloitte & Touche, Price Waterhouse and Grant Thornton. Some of the cases in which Mr. Levine served in a leadership role include Rosen v. Macromedia, Inc., where as co-lead counsel he obtained a \$48 million securities class action settlement in California state court, In re Gupta Corporation Securities Litigation, where as co-lead counsel he obtained a \$15 million settlement, Provenz v. Miller, where as co-lead counsel he obtained a \$15 million securities class action settlement, and Providian Credit Card Cases, where as co-lead counsel he obtained a class action settlement of \$105 million, one of the largest class action recoveries in the United States arising out of consumer credit card litigation. Mr. Levine leads the firm's pretrial preparation in securities litigation on behalf of Allianz of America, Inc., Fireman's Fund and other large private institutional investors against Grant Thornton and other defendants arising out of their investments in Winstar Communications, Inc.

Mr. Levine is the author of "E-Mail and Voice Mail Discovery Issues," Glasser LegalWorks (1998), "Discovery Techniques in Commercial Litigation and Recent Developments In the Rules of Discovery," American Trial Lawyers Association (1991), and the co-author of "The Business Judgment Rule and Derivative Actions," Practising Law Institute (1989). He has lectured on securities litigation under the Private Securities Litigation Reform Act of 1995, consumer fraud and predatory lending litigation, and computer discovery and electronic data retention risk control. Mr. Levine was recently appointed as a member of the Committee on Federal Courts of the State Bar of California. He is the past chair of the American Bar Association Litigation Section Subcommittee on Officers and Directors Liability. He also currently serves as Chairman of the Piedmont Planning Commission.

For nine years prior to joining Girard Gibbs, Mr. Levine was a partner at the New York law firm of Kaplan Fox & Kilsheimer LLP, where he specialized in securities fraud, accounting fraud and consumer class action litigation. Mr. Levine is a 1988 graduate of Fordham University School of Law. He received his undergraduate degree from Columbia University in 1985. Mr. Levine is a member of the California State Bar Association, New York State Bar Association, Connecticut Bar Association, American Bar Association, the Association of Business Trial Lawyers – Northern California, and the Association of Trial Lawyers of America. He is admitted to the New York, Connecticut and California Bars.

Elizabeth C. Pritzker is a seasoned litigation and trial attorney with broad experience in complex litigation matters, including the prosecution of consumer, product liability, and securities class actions.

Ms. Pritzker's consumer and product liability experience extends to new and emerging technologies. She served as co-lead counsel in a multi-district class action alleging that SONY BMG Music Entertainment had violated the Computer Fraud and Abuse Act by placing digital rights management software on music CDs distributed to the public (In re SONY BMG Technologies Litigation, S.D.N.Y. Case No. 1:05-cv-09575 (NRB)), and as co-lead counsel in a California state-court class action against Apple, Inc., alleging that Apple had made material misrepresentations and omissions with respect to the battery life of its early-generation iPod music players (In Re iPod Cases, J.C.C.P. No. 4335).

Ms. Pritzker currently serves as lead counsel in In Re General Motors Cases, JCCP No. 4396, a certified state court class action against General Motors alleging violations of California's "Secret Warranty" law, California Civil Code § 1794.90 et seq. She serves as Liaison Counsel for the Direct Purchaser Plaintiffs in In Re TFT-LCD (Flat Panel) Antitrust Litigation, MDL No. 1897, N.D.Cal. Master File No. C-07-1827-SI (multi-district class action alleging price-fixing by foreign and domestic manufacturers of Thin Film Transistor Liquid Crystal Display (TFT-LCD) products). She also has an ongoing and active role in several complex litigation matters, including: In Re Natural Gas Antitrust Cases I, II, III and IV, J.C.C.P. No. 4221 (coordinated antitrust class action litigation against numerous natural gas companies for manipulating the market for natural gas in California which has achieved settlements to date of \$153 million); and Nordberg v. Trilegiant Corporation et al., N.D. Cal. Case No. C-05-3246 (MHP) (federal class action alleging that Trilegiant's practice of placing consumers into the company's membership service programs, and billing them for "membership fees," without consumers' valid authorization violates federal and state consumer laws).

Prior to joining the firm, she served as counsel for the San Francisco Unified School District in a False Claim Act suit against Progress Energy Corp., and its subsidiary Progress Energy Solutions, Inc., that resulted in a \$43 million settlement for the District.

Ms. Pritzker is a 1989 graduate of the University of San Francisco School of Law. She received her undergraduate degree in Economics from McGill University in 1983. Ms. Pritzker is a member of the Association of Trial Lawyers of America, National Association of Consumer Advocates, Trial Lawyers for Public Justice, California Women Lawyers, Consumer Attorneys of California, the Bar Association of San Francisco, the San Mateo Bar Association, and the Alameda County Bar Association. Ms. Pritzker is admitted to the California Bar.

Aaron M. Sheanin has extensive experience in complex litigation matters, including the prosecution of securities fraud and corporate governance cases on behalf of individual and institutional investors, as well as antitrust and complex consumer actions. He also advises several state pension funds and private institutional investors with respect to securities matters. Mr. Sheanin currently serves as lead counsel in Brennan v. AT&T Corp., a

nationwide class action challenging MCI's practice of assessing long distance telephone service charges to non-customers, pending in the United States District Court for the Southern District of Illinois. He serves as co-chair of the Discovery Committee in Natural Gas Antitrust Cases I, II, III and IV, antitrust litigation against numerous natural gas companies for manipulating the California natural gas market, which has achieved settlements of \$153 million to date.

Mr. Sheanin is a 1999 graduate of Columbia University School of Law, where he was a James Kent Scholar and a Harlan Fiske Stone Scholar. He received his undergraduate degree from the University of California at Berkeley in 1993, where he was elected to Phi Beta Kappa. Mr. Sheanin is a member of the American Bar Association and the San Francisco Bar Association. He has presented before the American Bar Association's Task Force on Contingent Fees (Tort Trial and Insurance Practice Section), and is a contributing author to "California Class Actions Practice and Procedure" (Matthew Bender, 1st Ed. 2003). From 1999 to 2001, Mr. Sheanin was a Pro Se law clerk for the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit. Prior to joining Girard Gibbs, Mr. Sheanin was an associate with Lieff, Cabraser, Heimann & Bernstein LLP, where he had extensive experience prosecuting class action cases involving consumer protection, product defect and employment discrimination. In the summer of 1997, he was a judicial extern to the Honorable Barrington D. Parker, Jr. of the United States District Court, Southern District of New York. He is admitted to the New York, New Jersey and California Bars.

Amanda M. Steiner is a 1997 graduate of the University of California at Berkeley, Boalt Hall School of Law, where she served as an Associate Editor for the *Berkeley Journal of Employment and Labor Law* (1995-96) and Articles Editor for the *Berkeley Women's Law Journal* (1994-97). She received her undergraduate degree, *cum laude*, from Carleton College in 1991. Prior to joining Girard Gibbs, Ms. Steiner practiced at Wendel, Rosen, Black & Dean, LLP in Oakland, CA, where she handled a variety of complex litigation matters, including real estate development, construction issues, commercial and real estate contracts, mortgages and trust deeds, and lender-related disputes.

Prior to joining Wendel Rosen, Ms. Steiner was associated with law firms in San Francisco and Seattle, where she represented plaintiffs in all phases of class action litigation, with a particular focus on consumer protection, defective product and employment matters. Prior to obtaining her law degree, Ms. Steiner served as an extern for U.S. District Court Judge Marilyn Hall Patel, and also worked as a law clerk for the Criminal Division of the U.S. Attorney's Office, the Alameda County District Attorney, and the Hopi Appellate Court Clinic and Tribal Law Project. She is admitted to the California and Washington Bars. She is also admitted to practice before the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit as well as the United States District Court for the Northern District of California and the Western and Eastern District of Washington.

Steven G. Tidrick practices in the areas of antitrust, securities, consumer class actions, intellectual property, insurance laws, and complex commercial litigation.

Mr. Tidrick is a member of the American Bar Association Section on Antitrust. He is also a member of the State Bar of California Section on Antitrust and Unfair Competition,

Consumer Attorneys of California, San Francisco Trial Lawyers Association and the Alameda County Bar Association.

Mr. Tidrick is a 1999 graduate of Harvard Law School, where he served as Articles & Commentaries Editor for the Harvard Law Review. He also served as editor for the Harvard Civil Rights-Civil Liberties Law Review and the Harvard Environmental Law Review. He received his undergraduate degree, *magna cum laude*, from Harvard College in 1994, where he was elected to Phi Beta Kappa. Mr. Tidrick is Vice President of the Foundation of the State Bar of California, a nonprofit entity dedicated to providing opportunities for lawyers to support community projects and education to improve access to justice. Mr. Tidrick is a frequent speaker on governmental and political issues, most recently moderating the Attorney General Democratic Candidates' Forum and Oakland Mayoral Candidates' Debate. His writings have been published in such journals as the National Law Journal and The New Republic. From 1999 to 2000, Mr. Tidrick served as law clerk to the Honorable M. Margaret KcKeown, United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit. In 1998, he was a Teaching Fellow for the Harvard University Department of Government. Prior to joining Girard Gibbs, Mr. Tidrick was a senior associate with Boies, Schiller & Flexner LLP, where he successfully litigated complex matters involving antitrust, securities, commercial litigation and white-collar defense. He formerly was an associate with Foley Hoag LLP, where he litigated matters involving intellectual property, complex commercial litigation and insurance.

He is admitted to the Massachusetts and California Bars. He also is admitted to practice before the United States Court of Appeals for the First and Ninth Circuits, as well as the as well as the United States District Courts for the Northern, Central and Eastern Districts of California and the District of Massachusetts.

ASSOCIATES

Christina H. Connolly is a 2006 graduate, cum laude, of the University of California, Hastings College of Law, where she was a member of the Thurston Society and was the recipient of the Best Oral Advocate Award. She was also the recipient of the Witkin award in her Legal Writing and Criminal Law courses. She received her undergraduate degree in history, magna cum laude, from Brown University in 1997. Ms. Connolly was a summer 2005 extern for the Honorable Phyllis J. Hamilton of the United States District Court, Northern District of California. Ms. Connolly also served as a spring 2005 extern for the Honorable John E. Munter, San Francisco Superior Court. She is a member of the American Bar Association, the Bar Association of the San Francisco and the San Francisco Trial Lawyers Association. Ms. Connolly is admitted to the California Bar. She is also admitted to practice before the United States District Courts for the Northern, Central, Eastern and Southern Districts of California.

Todd Espinosa is a 2000 graduate of Harvard Law School, where he participated in the Harvard Legal Aid Bureau and Tenant Advocacy Project. He received his undergraduate degree from Harvard College in 1997 and a Master of City Planning degree from University of California at Berkeley in 2006. Before joining Girard Gibbs, Mr. Espinosa was a law clerk for the Honorable Claudia Wilken, United States District Court for the Northern District of California. He also worked as a legal research attorney for the Superior Court of California,

County of Santa Clara. Mr. Espinosa is admitted to the California Bar. He is also admitted to practice before the U.S. District Court for the Central District of California.

Dylan Hughes is a 2000 graduate of the University of California, Hastings College of Law. He received his undergraduate degree from the University of California at Berkeley in 1995. Mr. Hughes was a spring 2000 extern for the Honorable Charles A. Legge of the United States District Court, Northern District of California. Before joining Girard Gibbs, he was a law clerk for the Honorable Paul A. Mapes, Administrative Law Judge of the Office of Administrative Law Judges, United States Department of Labor. Mr. Hughes is a member of the American Bar Association and the Consumer Rights Section of the Barristers Club. He is admitted to the California Bar. He also is admitted to practice before the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit, as well as the United States District Courts for the Northern, Central, Eastern and Southern Districts of California.

Daniel T. LeBel is a 2006 graduate of the University of California, Hastings College of Law, where he completed a civil litigation concentration. He received his undergraduate degree, with distinction in general scholarship, from the University of California at Berkeley in 1999. Mr. LeBel was a fall 2005 extern for the Honorable Paul Alvarado, San Francisco Superior Court. He is a member of the San Francisco Bar Association, the American Trial Lawyers Association and Trial Lawyers for Public Justice. Mr. LeBel is admitted to the California Bar.

Geoffrey A. Munroe is a 2003 graduate of the University of California at Berkeley, Boalt Hall School of Law, where he was the recipient of the American Jurisprudence Award in Torts, Business Law & Policy and Computer Law. In addition, he served as a member of the submissions team for the *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* (2000-01) and was involved in Moot Court and Appellate Advocacy. He received his undergraduate degree in chemistry from the University of California at Berkeley in 2000. Before joining Girard Gibbs, Mr. Munroe was an associate with Samuel E. Goldstein & Associates from 2003 to 2007, where he handled a variety of appellate and complex litigation matters, including commercial law, real property and lender-related disputes. He is admitted to the California Bar. He is also admitted to practice before the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit, as well as the United States District Courts for the Northern, Central and Southern Districts of California.

SIGNIFICANT RECOVERIES

Some of the cases in which the firm has had a leadership role are described below:

In re Providian Credit Card Cases, J.C.C.P. No. 4085 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Francisco County). Girard Gibbs served as court-appointed co-lead counsel in this nationwide class action suit brought on behalf of Providian credit card holders. The lawsuit alleged that Providian engaged in unlawful, unfair and fraudulent business practices by charging its customers unauthorized fees and charges. The Hon. Stuart Pollack approved a \$105 million settlement, plus injunctive relief, which is one of the largest class action recoveries in the United States arising out of consumer credit card litigation.

In re iPod Cases, JCCP No. 4355 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Mateo County). Girard Gibbs, as court appointed co-lead counsel, negotiated a settlement conservatively valued at approximately \$15 million which provided warranty extensions, battery replacements, cash payments, and store credits for those class members who experienced a battery failure. In granting final approval of the settlement, the Hon. Beth L. Freeman said that the class was represented by “extremely well qualified” counsel who negotiated a “significant and substantial benefit” for the class members.

In re Sony BMG CD Technologies Litigation, Case No. 1:05-cv-09575-NRB (S.D.N.Y.). Girard Gibbs served as co-lead counsel in this class action for violation of the Computer Fraud and Abuse Act, 18 U.S.C. § 1030, *et seq.* on behalf of millions of consumers who purchased SONY BMG music compact discs encoded with digital rights management (“DRM”) software which limited CD functionality and acted as spyware on the users’ computers. The Hon. Naomi Reice Buchwald granted approval to a settlement that provided for a nationwide recall of certain CDs, the dissemination of software utilities to remove the offending DRM, cash and other compensation for consumers, and injunctive relief governing SONY BMG’s use of DRM.

In re PayPal Litigation, Case No. C-02-1227-JF (PVT) (N.D.Cal., S.J. Div. 2002). Girard Gibbs served as co-lead counsel in this nationwide class action brought against PayPal alleging violations of the Electronic Funds Transfer Act (“EFTA”) and California consumer protection statutes. The plaintiffs alleged that PayPal did not comply with the EFTA when restricting access to consumers’ PayPal accounts, initiating certain electronic funds transfers or its error resolution processes. On September 24, 2004, Judge Fogel granted final approval to a settlement valued at \$14.35 million in cash and returned funds, plus injunctive relief to ensure compliance with the EFTA.

In re America Online Spin-Off Accounts Litigation, MDL No. 04-1581-RSWL (C.D. Cal.). Girard Gibbs served as court-appointed co-lead counsel in this nationwide class action suit brought on behalf of America Online subscribers who were billed for a second account without their knowledge, authorization or consent. The litigation settled for \$25 million and certain changes in AOL’s billing and account practices.

Allen Lund Co., Inc. v. AT&T Corp., Case No. C 98-1500-DDP (AJW) (C.D. Cal.). This class action lawsuit was brought on behalf of small businesses whose long-distance service was switched to Business Discount Plan, Inc. Girard Gibbs was appointed class counsel by the Honorable Dean D. Pregerson. The settlement, providing for full cash refunds and free long-distance telephone service, was approved in December 1999.

In re MCI Non-Subscriber Telephone Rates Litigation, MDL Docket No. 1275 (S.D. Ill.). This class action lawsuit was brought on behalf of all MCI subscribers who were charged MCI’s non-subscriber or “casual caller” rates and surcharges instead of the lower rates which MCI advertises and which subscribers expect to be charged. Ten cases were consolidated for pretrial proceedings before the Honorable David R. Herndon, U.S. District Judge for the Southern District of Illinois. Judge Herndon appointed Girard Gibbs as co-lead counsel for the consolidated actions. On March 29, 2001, Judge Herndon granted final approval of a settlement for over \$90 million in cash.

In re Natural Gas Antitrust Cases I, II, III and IV, J.C.C.P. No. 4221 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Diego County). Girard Gibbs served in a leadership capacity in this coordinated antitrust litigation against numerous natural gas companies for manipulating the California natural gas market, which has achieved settlements of nearly \$160 million to date.

In re American Express Financial Advisors Securities Litigation, Case No. 04-cv-01773-DAB (S.D.N.Y.). Girard Gibbs served as co-lead counsel in this class action, brought on behalf of individuals who bought financial plans and invested in mutual funds from American Express Financial Advisors. The case alleged that American Express steered its clients into underperforming “shelf space funds” to reap kickbacks and other financial benefits. On July 13, 2007, the Court granted final approval to a cash settlement of \$100 million in addition to other relief.

In re Literary Works In Electronic Databases Copyright Litigation, MDL No. 1379 (GBD) (S.D.N.Y. 2000). Girard Gibbs served as co-lead counsel in this class action brought on behalf of freelance authors alleging that after freelance authors’ works were published in newspapers, magazines, and other print publications with the authors’ permission, those publications then licensed the works without the authors’ permission to the commercial databases for electronic publication, in violation of the Federal Copyright Act. Five cases were consolidated for pretrial proceedings before the Honorable George B. Daniels, U.S. District Judge for the Southern District of New York. On September 27, 2005, Judge Daniels granted final approval of an \$18 million cash settlement.

Lehman v. Blue Shield of California, Case No. CGC-03-419349 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Francisco County). In this class action lawsuit alleging that Blue Shield engaged in unlawful, unfair and fraudulent business practices when it modified the risk tier structure of its individual and family health care plans, a \$6.5 million settlement was negotiated on behalf of former and current Blue Shield subscribers residing in California. The Honorable James L. Warren granted final approval of the settlement in March 2006.

Roy v. Hyundai Motor America, Case No. SACV 05-483-AHS (C.D. Cal.). Girard Gibbs served as court appointed co-lead counsel in this nationwide class action suit brought on behalf of Hyundai Elantra owners and lessees, based on allegations that the passenger air bag system installed on the Elantras was defective. A settlement was negotiated whereby Hyundai agreed to repair the air bag systems, provide reimbursement for transportation related expenses and an alternative dispute resolution program allowing for trade-ins and buy-backs. In approving the settlement negotiated by Girard Gibbs, the Honorable Alicemarie H. Stotler presiding, described the settlement as “pragmatic” and a “win-win” for all involved.

Powers Law Offices, P.C. v. Cable & Wireless USA, Inc., Case No. 99 CV 12007 (EFH) (D. Mass 1999). Class action brought on behalf of all Cable & Wireless subscribers who were overcharged for recurring and incorrect fees on lines that were not presubscribed to C&W at the time. Girard Gibbs prosecuted the case from 1999 through 2005, and on October 27, 2005, Judge Harrington granted final approval of the \$8 million settlement and the Bankruptcy Judge approved the 30% distribution from the unsecured creditors’ fund of the bankruptcy liquidation proceeds.

Mitchell v. American Fair Credit Association, Case No. 785811-2 (Cal. Super. Ct. Alameda County); ***Mitchell v. Bankfirst, N.A.***, Case No. C-97-1421-MMC (N.D. Cal.). This class action lawsuit was brought on behalf of California residents who became members of the American Fair Credit Association (“AFCA”). Plaintiffs alleged that AFCA operated an illegal credit repair scheme. The Honorable James Richman certified the class and appointed the firm as class counsel on April 12, 1999. In February 2003, Judge Ronald Sabraw of the Alameda County Superior Court and Judge Maxine Chesney of the U.S. District Court for the Northern District of California granted final approval to settlements valued at over \$40 million. See *Mitchell, et al., v. American Fair Credit Association, Inc., et al.*, 99 Cal. App. 4th 1345 (2002) (first reported decision under the California Credit Services Act of 1984).

In re LookSmart Litigation, Case No. 02-407778 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Francisco County). This nationwide class action suit was brought against LookSmart, Ltd. on behalf of LookSmart’s customers who paid an advertised “one time payment” to have their web sites listed in LookSmart’s directory, only to be later charged additional payments to continue service. The action involved claims for breach of contract and violation of California’s consumer protection laws, among other things. On October 31, 2003, the Honorable Ronald M. Quidachay granted final approval of a nationwide class action settlement providing cash and benefits valued at approximately \$20 million.

Steff v. United Online, Inc., Case No. BC265953, (Los Angeles Super. Ct.). This nationwide class action suit was brought against NetZero, Inc. and its parent, United Online, Inc., by former NetZero customers. The Plaintiffs alleged that Defendants falsely advertised their internet service as being unlimited and guaranteed for a specific period of time when it was not, in violation of Consumers Legal Remedies Act, Civil Code §§ 17500 *et seq.* and the Unfair Competition Law, Business And Professions Code §§ 17200 *et seq.* The Honorable Victoria G. Chaney of the Los Angeles Superior Court granted final approval of a settlement that provides full refunds to customers whose services were cancelled and additional cash compensation. The settlement also places restrictions on Defendants’ advertising.

Mackouse v. The Good Guys - California, Inc., Case No. 2002-049656, (Alameda County Super. Ct.). This nationwide class action lawsuit was brought against The Good Guys and its affiliates alleging violations of the Song-Beverly Warranty Act and other California consumer statutes. The Plaintiff alleged that The Good Guys failed to honor its service contracts, which were offered for sale to customers and designed to protect a customer’s purchase after the manufacturer’s warranty expired. In May 9, 2003, the Honorable Ronald M. Sabraw granted final approval of a settlement that provides cash refunds or services at the customer’s election.

Stoddard v. Advanta Corp., Case No. 97C-08-206-VAB (Del. Superior Ct.). This nationwide class action lawsuit was brought on behalf of cardholders who were promised a fixed APR for life in connection with balance transfers, whose APR was then raised pursuant to a notice of change in terms. The Honorable Vincent A. Bifferato approved a \$7.25 million settlement and appointed firm as co-lead counsel for the settlement class.

In re America Online, Inc. Version 5.0 Software Litigation, MDL Docket No. 1341 (S.D. Fla.). Girard Gibbs served as co-lead counsel in this MDL proceeding, which centralized 45 class actions. The action involved alleged violations of the Computer Fraud

and Abuse Act, 18 U.S.C. §§ 1030 *et seq.*, federal antitrust laws and state consumer protection statutes based on AOL's distribution of its Version 5.0 software upgrade. The Honorable Alan S. Gold granted final approval to a \$15.5 million cash settlement on August 1, 2002.

Mager v. First Bank of Marin, CV-S-00-1524-PMP (D. Nev.). This nationwide class action was brought on behalf of people who were enrolled in First Bank of Marin's credit card program. In May 2002, the Judge Pro of the U.S. District Court for the District of Nevada approved a settlement providing for cash and non-cash benefits to class members.

Scheiner v. i2 Technologies, Inc., et al., Case No. 3:01-CV-418-H (N.D. Tex.). Girard Gibbs represented lead plaintiff, the Kansas Public Employees Retirement System, and served as co-lead counsel in this securities fraud class action on behalf of investors in i2 Technologies. The Hon. Barefoot Sanders approved cash settlements for \$88 million from the company, its officers and its former auditor, Arthur Andersen LLP. As part of the settlement, i2 agreed to institute significant corporate governance reforms.

CalSTRS v. Qwest Communications, et al., Case No. 415546 (Cal. Super. Ct. San Francisco County). Girard Gibbs represented the California State Teachers Retirement System in this opt-out securities fraud case against Qwest Communications, Inc. and certain of its officers and directors, as well as its outside auditor Arthur Andersen. The case resulted in a precedent-setting \$45 million settlement for California school teachers.

In re Winstar Communications Securities Litigation, Case No. 01 Civ. 11522 (S.D.N.Y). Girard Gibbs represents Allianz of America, Inc., Fireman's Fund and other large private institutional investors in federal securities litigation against Grant Thornton and other defendants arising out of their investments in Winstar Communications, Inc. The firm has obtained settlements to date from Lucent Technologies and the individual officers and directors of Winstar, and is continuing to prosecute the case against Grant Thornton, outside auditor to Winstar.

In re Prison Realty Securities Litigation, Case No. 3:99-0452 (M.D. Tenn.). Girard Gibbs served as co-lead counsel in this securities class action brought on behalf of investors against a real estate investment trust and its officers and directors, following defendants' alleged false statements made in the context of a merger between Corrections Corporation of America and CCA Prison Realty Trust and subsequent operation of the merged entity. On February 13, 2001, the Court granted final approval to a settlement for over \$104 million in cash and stock.

In re Digex, Inc. Shareholder Litigation, Consol. Case No. 18336 (Del. Ch. Ct. 2000). Girard Gibbs represented the Kansas Public Employees Retirement System, one of two institutional lead plaintiffs in this lawsuit whereby minority shareholders of Digex, Inc. sued to enjoin MCI WorldCom's planned acquisition of a controlling interest in Digex through a merger with Intermedia Communications, Inc., the majority shareholder. In a settlement approved by Delaware Chancery Court on April 6, 2000, a fund consisting of \$165 million in MCI WorldCom stock and \$15 million in cash was secured for Digex shareholders, as well as non-cash benefits valued at \$450 million.

In re Oxford Tax Exempt Fund Securities Litigation, Case No. WMN-95-3643 (D. Md.). Girard Gibbs served as co-lead counsel in this class and derivative litigation brought on behalf of a real estate limited partnership with assets of over \$200 million. Settlement providing for exempt issuance of securities under section 3(a)(10) of Securities Act of 1933, public listing of units, and additional settlement benefits valued at over \$10 million approved January 31, 1997.

Calliott v. HFS, Inc., Case No. 3:97-CV-0924-L (N.D. Tex.). Girard Gibbs intervened on behalf of an institutional client in this securities class action arising out of bankruptcy of Amre, Inc., a seller of home remodeling and repair services. Girard Gibbs was designated lead plaintiff's counsel under Private Securities Litigation Reform Act. Settlements for \$7.3 million were approved August 1999 and December 2000.

In re Total Renal Care Securities Litigation, Case No. 99-01750 (C.D. Cal.). This securities fraud action arose out of restatement of earnings by healthcare provider, brought under the PSLRA by the Louisiana Teachers' Retirement System and the Louisiana School Employees Retirement System. Settled for \$25 million and issuer's commitment to adopt comprehensive corporate governance reforms. Girard Gibbs served as liaison counsel.

In re Towers Financial Corporation Noteholders Litigation, MDL No. 994 (S.D.N.Y.). This securities and RICO class action was brought against promoters and professionals associated with failed investment scheme described by United States Securities and Exchange Commission as "largest Ponzi scheme in U.S. history." \$6 million in partial settlements. \$250 million judgment entered against four senior Towers executives. Girard Gibbs served as liaison counsel and as a plaintiffs' executive committee member. See Dinsmore v. Squadron, Ellenoff, Plesent, Sheinfeld & Sorkin, 945 F. Supp. 84 (S.D.N.Y.1996), rev'd, No. 97-7011, 1998 U.S. App. LEXIS 1448 (2d Cir. Jan. 28, 1998); In re Towers Financial Corporation Noteholders Litigation, 177 F.R.D. 167 (S.D.N.Y. 1997) ("class counsel--particularly Plaintiffs' Liaison counsel, Daniel Girard--has represented the plaintiffs diligently and ably in the several years that this litigation has been before me").

Ho v. San Francisco Unified School District, Case No. C-94-2418-WHO (N.D. Cal.). This civil rights action was brought on behalf of a certified class of San Francisco public school students of Chinese descent to terminate racial and ethnic quotas imposed under 1983 desegregation consent decree. See Ho v. San Francisco Unified Sch. Dist., 965 F. Supp. 1316 (N.D. Cal. 1997), aff'd 147 F.3d 854 (9th Cir. 1998); see also 143 Cong. Rec. S6097, 6099 (1997) (statement of United States Senator Hatch referring to testimony of class representative before Senate Judiciary Committee).

In re World War II Era POW Litigation, Case No. C-99-5042-VRW (N.D. Cal.). This class action lawsuit was brought on behalf of American veterans who, as prisoners-of-war held by the Japanese during World War II, were forced to perform slave labor for Japanese industry. Commenting on the Ninth Circuit decision affirming dismissal of the claims, Mr. Girard was quoted in the New York Times, "It's not unusual that you see a demand for payment that isn't legally enforceable. But the demand stands. If the position of the Japanese companies involved is that they refuse to consider the demand for compensation and stand on legal defenses, the moral consequences are what they are."